#### **Historic Preservation Board**

# **August 23, 2022 Meeting Minutes**

#### **Commission Chambers**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** 

Amanda Skier, Chairperson

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member

Dan Pichney, Member

James Murphy, 1st Alternate

Todd MaClean, 2<sup>nd</sup> Alternate

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** 

Kenneth Breslauer, Member

Reginald Stambaugh, Member

Donna Tomaszewski, Member

**STAFF PRESENT:** 

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Tonya Way, Board Secretary

**BOARD ATTORNEY:** 

Ms. Arlene Franconero, Assistant City Attorney

## I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chairperson Amanda Skier, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:01 P.M., Tonya Way, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

# II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Chairperson Amanda Skier asked if there were any changes to the agenda as presented. Seeing that there were not any. Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to approve the Agenda.

Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to approve the Agenda for August 23, 2022.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

Chairperson Amanda Skier asked if there were any changes to the July 26, 2022 Minutes as presented. There were none. Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to Approve the Minutes.

Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to Approve the Minutes for July 26, 2022.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

## III.REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

- a) Staff approvals (level 1, 2, zoning,). Mrs. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, reported that since the last meeting of July 26, 2022, Staff reviewed 158 Level I applications and 6 Zoning Reviews.
- b) **General communications -** Mrs. Mittner welcomed the Board's newest member Todd MaClean to the board.

#### IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier stated that the matters before the public are quasi-judicial in nature. The decisions of the Board are made from competent and substantial evidence that comes before them. For each case, after the applicant presents their case, Staff will provide a presentation and then the public will have an opportunity to speak or have their comments read into the record from previously received correspondence. The applicant can make a 10-minute presentation for regular cases or take 15 minutes for a proposed demolition. After Staff's presentation, the Board will open the floor up for public comment, which is restricted to three minutes per speaker. The applicant may have a short rebuttal after the public speaks. The Board will then go into executive session. Prior to rendering a decision, the Board will confirm no additional public comments have been received by Staff. Members of the Board need to disclose if they have discussed the cases with anyone prior to tonight's meeting.

# A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

- Chairperson Amanda Skier disclosed she spoke with the Architect and Developer
  of HPB 22-17 prior to case coming before the board. She also spoke with Mrs.
  Friederike Mittner regarding all cases on the agenda, but she would base her
  decisions upon the evidence presented.
- Mr. Dan Pichney None.
- Grabriel Jaroslavsky None
- Mr. James Murphy None.

• Mr. Todd MaClean – disclosed that he has a conflict of interest with HPB 22-17, as he is the Landscape Designer for the 2501 S. Flagler Drive property.

## V. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

## **B. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS**

Ms. Tonya Way, Board Secretary, swore in Staff and members of the public who wished to speak.

## VI. CONSENT CASES

# 6.1 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-75:

#### 3016 S. Olive Avenue

Historic District: Prospect/Southland Park

Requested action: Pre-Construction, New Accessory, Additions/Alterations

Location: 3016 S. Olive Ave

Property Owner: Jordan and Nicole Stein

Applicant: David M. Rosenthal Architect, Inc

Case Manager: Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

# 6.2 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-76:</u>

# 326 Kenilworth Boulevard

Historic District: Central Park

Requested action: New Construction

Location: 326 Kenilworth Blvd

Property Owner: Thomas Curtis

Applicant: Thomas Curtis

Case Manager: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

# 6.3 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-77:

# 529 34th Street

Historic District: Old Northwood

Requested action: Additions

Location: 529 34<sup>th</sup> St

Property Owner: 529 34<sup>th</sup> Street LLC

Applicant: Polly Daugherty

Case Manager: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** Consent Cases <u>No. 22-75</u>, 3016 S. Olive Avenue, <u>No. 22-76</u>, 326 Kenilworth Boulevard and <u>No. 22-77</u>, 529 34<sup>th</sup> Street.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

## VII. CONTINUED CASES

# 7.1 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-17:

# 2501 S. Flagler Drive

## CONTINUED TO SEPTEMBER MEETING

Historic District: El Cid

Requested Action: New Construction

Location: 2501 S. Flagler Dr.

Property Owner: 2501 S. Flagler Drive, LLC.

Applicant: Daniel A. Menard

Case Manager: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by applicant.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

1. Demolition of existing structure.

- 2. Construction of a new two-story single-family home with a detached pool house of approximately 7,848SF total including the loggias, terraces and accessory structure. The new construction is the Contemporary, Deco inspired style with a V-shaped plan, flat roof, vertically oriented and circular windows.
- 3. Site work including a pool.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-17.

Update: This case has been continued since the March 22, 2022, Historic Preservation Board meeting. Since then the applicant has revised plans based on Board and staff recommendations.

The one-story structure is a non-contributing building was built in 1953, it is constructed of concrete block, surfaced with stucco, and has a hip roof surfaced with S-tile. The original features have been replaced over time, such as the concrete tile roof, as well as the jalousie, awning and picture windows.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

# 7.2 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-62:

## 320 Sunset Road

Historic District:

El Cid

Requested Action:

Demolition/New Construction

Location:

320 Sunset Road

Property Owner:

731 Price Lawyers LLC

Applicant:

Sam Blake/Brian Brady

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by Brian Brady.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

- 1. Demolition of existing non-contributing two-story midcentury modern multifamily structure.
- 2. Construction of a new two-story single-family home of approximately 4,328SF with detached one-story accessory structure of approximately 288SF both in a British Colonial style.
- 3. Site work

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-62.

The existing two-story midcentury modern non-contributing structure was built in 1954, the property is located in the El Cid Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

One public comment was read into the record from resident of 319 Sunset Road.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Gabe Jaroslavsky made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-62 Demolition.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

Gabe Jaroslavsky **made a motion to Approve** <u>Case No. 22-62</u> New Construction, with the following conditions(s).

- 1. The overall height of the building shall be reduced by at least 18 inches.
- 2. All windows shall have external, dimensional muntins and clear glass. Low e coating is permissible on sides and rear only.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 7.3 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-68:

## 230 Argyle Road

Historic District: Prospect/Southland Park

Requested Action: Ad Valorem Preconstruction - Additions

Location: 230 Argyle Rd

Property Owner: Summit Argyle LLC

Applicant: Scott Baruch/J. Scott Baruch & Associates

Case Manager: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by applicant, Scott Baruch.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

1. Construction of two, two-story additions totaling approximately 2,500SF to the sides of the main structure plus a 343SF Porte Cochere

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-68

This contributing home was built in 1925 in the Mediterranean Revival style by E.B. Walton and is part of the Prospect/Southland Park Historic District. It's defining features includes a second floor Juliet and knee wall balcony and a wing wall on the ground floor next to the arched entry. This case was continued from the July 26, 2022, Historic Preservation Board meeting to allow the applicant to address the Board's concerns of massing of the great room and the height of the Porte cochere and master bedroom.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no public comments provided.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Dan Pichney made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-68.

Gabriel Jaroslacsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 7.4 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-74</u>:

# 326 Edgewood Drive

Historic District:

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested Action:

Class B Special Use Permit – Accessory Apartment lot width

waiver

Location:

326 Edgewood Drive

Property Owner:

Ysmael Nuno and Molly Greene

Applicant:

Ysmael Nuno and Molly Greene

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by George Gentil on behalf of the applicant.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

A Class B Special Use Permit, with a waiver request from Section 94-303(b)(2) of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations, to allow for an accessory structure to be utilized as an accessory apartment on a 50' wide lot where a 60' width is required.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-74.

The property currently has a Single-Family (SF) land use designation and a Single-Family High-Density Context 2(SF14-C3) zoning designation

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

Katherine Weems – 321 Edgewood Dr – For

Tody Smith – 325 Edgewood Dr - For

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Board Members asked for clarification as to whether the structure would be used as a commercial kitchen.

Applicant George verified and ensured the intent is **not** to be used as a commercial kitchen and it meets all the Comprehensive plans.

Dan Pichney **made a motion to Approve** <u>Case No. 22-74</u> Class B Special Use Permit, with the following conditions(s).

- 1. Three off-street parking be provided.
- 2. A license is required for any commercial use of the additional unit.

James Murphy **seconded the motion; the motion passed** 3-2. Opposed: Gabriel – requesting 10' which 20 percent of the required width is too much. Todd – doesn't believe that the full picture has been presented.

6:07pm, City's Assistant Attorney Arlene Franconero asked for a brief break to research the voting procedures and requirements to ensure there's sufficient majority vote.

# 7.5 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-56:

# 309 Edgewood Drive

Historic District:

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested Action:

Alterations – Porch Enclosure

Location:

309 Edgewood Drive

Property Owner:

Lane Fraum

Applicant:

Carlos Gonzalez

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Applicant not present in Commission Chambers for hearing

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

1. Enclosure of the currently screened-in front porch with single hung and fixed impact windows.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board <u>Case No. 22-56</u>.

This contributing property was built in 1947 in the Frame Vernacular style and is located within the Prospect/Southland Park Historic District.

# See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier asked Historic Preservation Planner Anne Hamilton to explain efforts made with notifying the applicant of the meeting beforehand. Per Ms. Hamilton, contact was made on several occasions with the applicant, explaining the process and procedure required to enclose the porch. However, the applicant was not present at the July 26, 2022 Historic Preservation Board Meeting and the case was motioned and approved to be continued on the August 23, 2022, Historic Preservation Board meeting. The applicant was notified of the continuance and given the date and time of the August 23, 2022 meeting. To no avail the applicant still was not present. Also, on Friday August 19, 2022, a site visit was

completed by Ms. Hamilton, the visit revealed that the work (porch enclosure), has already been completed by the applicant without proper authorization.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

One public comment was read into the record.

# **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Gabe Jaroslavsky **made a motion to Deny** Case No. 22-56 Alterations – Porch Enclosure. Proposed request **does not comply** with Standards 9 and 10 of the Secretary of the Interior's <u>Standards for Rehabilitation</u>. The visual impact of enclosing this porch, which spans most of the primary façade, will too greatly alter its appearance.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

#### VIII. NEW BUSINESS

# 8.1 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-78:

## 1409 Georgia Avenue

Historic District:

Grandview Heights

Requested Action:

Variance – Side Setback

Location:

1409 Georgia Avenue

Property Owner:

Jonathan Burgess and Lindsay Scherr

Applicant:

Polly Daugherty

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by applicant, Polly Daugherty.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

1. For a variance from Section 94-81(b)(2) of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations, which requires a primary structure to have a 5' minimum side setback in the Historic Single-Family High Density (SF14-C2) Residential zoning district at 1409 Georgia Avenue. Applicant is requesting a 3.2' side setback

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-78.

This contributing home was built in 1924 by Cornelius Meerdink and the house is known as the Otto and alma Widdell House. The home is classified as Vernacular in style and have lots of Bungalow influences and is part of the Grandview Heights Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no public comments provided.

#### EXECUTIVE SESSION

Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-78.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 8.2 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-79:

## 1409 Georgia Avenue

Historic District: Grandview Heights

Requested Action: Ad Valorem Preconstruction – Alterations/Additions

Location: 1409 Georgia Avenue

Property Owner: Jonathan Burgess and Lindsay Scherr

Applicant: Polly Daugherty

Case Manager: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by applicant, Polly Daugherty.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

For an Ad Valorem Preconstruction – for construction of a second-floor addition of approximately 881SF and a remodeling of the ground floor and expansion of approximately 188SF plus a covered porch of 107SF.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-79.

This contributing home and accessory structure were built in 1924 by Cornelius Meerdink and the house is known as the Otto and alma Widdell House. Both are classified as Vernacular in style and have lots of Bungalow influences and is part of the Grandview Heights Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

One public comment was read into record, as well as several others being included into the meeting packet.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-79.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 8.3 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-80:

## 721 Kanuga Drive

Historic District: Flamingo Park

Requested Action: Alteration/Additions

Location: 721 Kanuga Drive

Property Owner: Kanuga Drive Development LLC

Applicant: Sam Fisch

Case Manager: Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by Richard Bermer on behalf of the applicant.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

- 1. Alterations to the existing home, including new windows and doors.
- 2. Addition of a master suite, loggia and second story to existing home, totaling approximately 2,469SF.
- 3. Interior and site work.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-80.

This contributing home was built 1946 in the Ranch style and is part of the Flamingo Park Historic District. It has no real character-defining features and has had substantial alterations over time lessening its architectural integrity.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no public comments provided.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to Continue** <u>Case No. 22-80</u>, to the September 27, 2022 Historic Preservation Board meeting.

- 1. Restudy differentiating alterations from existing
- 2. Provide plans showing existing and proposed
- 3. Provide a survey

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 8.4 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-81:</u>

### 622 Westwood Road

Historic District:

Sunshine Park

Requested Action:

**New Construction** 

Location:

622 Westwood Road

Property Owner:

Malfredo LLC

Applicant:

The Benedict Bullock Group, PA

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by applicant, Brian Bullock.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

1. Proposed new construction of a two-story Mediterranean style single-family home of approximately 2,972 SF and accessory structure of approximately 715SF.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-81.

This vacant lot is located within the Sunshine Park Historic District. The lot was previously occupied by a one-story Mission residence which was built in 1925 by Edward Roddy and was demolished in 2019 prior to the establishment of Historic District as Sunshine Park.

# See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

Several public comments were read into the record.

# **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Dan Pichney made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-81, with condition(s).

- 1. All windows shall have a multi-lite grid pattern with external, dimensional muntins, bronze or white frames, and clear glass. Low e coating is permissible on sides and rear only.
  - a. The three windows above the main entry shall be revised to four windows.
  - b. The three windows above the front entry of the accessory structure shall be revised to two pairs of windows. Two windows shall also be added to the front of the accessory structure on either side of the entry.
  - c. A window shall be added to the front of the garage
- 2. The structure shall be shifted South to allow for a 25' front setback as required by the SF14-C2 zoning regulations.
- 3. The front facing gable on the second story of the main house shall be revised to a hip roof to better reflect the rooflines of the existing homes in Sunshine Park.

James Murphy seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 8.5 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-82:

# 415 58th Street

Historic District:

Northwood Harbor

Requested Action:

Alterations

Location:

415 58th Street

Property Owner:

Jam Wellington Properties LLC

Applicant:

Aaron Menitoff

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, 28Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by the applicant, Aaron Menitoff.

The applicant requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. Installation of twenty-four (24) shutters, in a mixture of accordion, removable panel and Bahama styles.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-82.

The contributing property was built in 1926, it is a one-story Mission style residence, located with the Northwood Harbor Historic district.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no public comments provided.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Todd MaClean **made a motion to Approve** Case No. 22-82, with condition(s)

1. The front three shutters that are currently proposed to be Bahama shutters shall be revised to removable panels.

Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# 8.6 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-83:

5510 Spruce Avenue

Historic District:

Northwood Harbor

Requested Action:

Alterations

Location:

5510 Spruce Avenue

Property Owner:

Aaron Menitoff and Julie Larson

Applicant:

Aaron Menitoff

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by the applicant.

The applicant requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. Four permanent Bahama-style hurricane shutters to be installed on windows in an interior courtyard.

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board <u>Case No. 22-83</u>.

This contributing property was built in 1926, it is a one-story Mission style residence, located in the Northwood Harbor Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no public comments provided.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Todd MaClean made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-83.

Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

# Adjournment

Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Todd MaClean made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0

Chairperson Amanda Skier adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:09 P.M.

Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

\* \* \* \* \*

This signature is to attest that the undersigned is the Chairperson, or designee, of the Historic Preservation Board Meeting and that the information provided herein is the true and correct Minutes for the August 23, 2022, meeting of the Historic Preservation Board Meeting, dated this day of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2022.

Chairperson (or designee)