# Historic Preservation Board June 28, 2022 Meeting Minutes Commission Chambers

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Amanda Skier, Chairperson

Kristin Kellogg, Vice-Chairperson

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member

Dan Pichney, Member

Kenneth Breslauer, Member Reginald Stambaugh, Member James Murphy, 1st Alternate

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Donna Tomaszewski, Member

**STAFF PRESENT:** 

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, Anne

Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner, Tonya Way, Board

Secretary

**BOARD ATTORNEY:** 

Ms. Arlene Franconero, Assistant City Attorney

## I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chairperson Amanda Skier, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:00 P.M., Tonya Way, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

## II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Chairperson Amanda Skier asked if there were any changes to the agenda as presented. Stated by Chairperson Amanda Skier, there was a public comment for 3707 Merrell Ave, Case 22-46, to be pulled from the Consent agenda. Chairperson Skier also asked if there were any changes to the agenda from board members. There were none. Chairperson Skier requested a motion to Approve the amended agenda.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a **motion to Approve** the amended Agenda for the June 28, 2022 meeting.

Mr. Ken Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

Chairperson Amanda Skier asked if there were any changes to the May 24th Minutes as presented. There were none. Chairperson requested a motion to Approve the Minutes.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a **motion to Approve** the Minutes for May 24th, 2022.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

## III. REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

- a) Staff approvals (level 1, 2, zoning,). Ms. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, reported that since the last meeting of May 24, 2022, Staff reviewed 166 Level I applications and 68 Zoning Reviews.
- b) **General communications -** Mrs. Mittner directed the Board Members' attention to the laminated sheet in their folders showing the new format that is to be utilized during the Ex-Parte Communications. Also, Notating, that as of two weeks ago, Sunshine Park officially became the 18<sup>th</sup> Historic District.

## IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier stated that the matters before the public are quasi-judicial in nature. The decisions of the Board are made from competent and substantial evidence that comes before them. For each case, after the applicant presents their case, Staff will provide a presentation and then the public will have an opportunity to speak or have their comments read into the record from previously received correspondence. The applicant can make a 10-minute presentation for regular cases or take 15 minutes for a proposed demolition. After Staff's presentation, the Board will open the floor up for public comment, which is restricted to three minutes per speaker. The applicant may have a short rebuttal after the public speaks. The Board will then go into executive session. Prior to rendering a decision, the Board will confirm no additional public comments have been

received by Staff. Members of the Board need to disclose if they have discussed the cases with anyone prior to tonight's meeting.

## A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

- Chairperson Amanda Skier disclosed she spoke with Mrs. Friederike Mittner regarding all cases on the agenda. Also, Chairperson Skier spoke with property agent Robert Kemp regarding HPB Case No 22-45, but she would base her decisions upon the evidence presented.
- Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg disclosed she has a conflict of interest regarding case HPB 22-31 and HPB 22-52, 241 Plymouth Road, she will not be voting and would excuse herself prior to the cases being heard.
- Mr. Dan Pichney None.
- Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky None
- Mr. Kenneth Breslauer None.
- Mr. Reginald Stambaugh None.
- Mr. James Murphy None.

## V. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

## A. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS

Ms. Tonya Way, Board Secretary, swore in Staff and members of the public who wished to speak.

## VI. CONSENT CASES

# 6.1 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-17A:</u>

## **106 Roosevelt Place**

Historic District:

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested action:

Revision to previous approve plans

Location:

106 Roosevelt Place

Property Owner:

Sena Group LLC

Applicant:

Denise Cravy, LCA Architecture

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

## 6.2 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-44:

205 Greymon Drive

Historic District:

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested action:

Ad Valorem Preconstruction; Additions/Alterations

Location:

205 Greymon Drive

Property Owner:

David Thompson

Applicant:

Design Methods Anthony Harrington

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

## 6.3 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-47:

## 3301 Greenwood Avenue

Historic District:

Northwood Hills

Requested action:

**New Construction** 

Location:

3301 Greenwood Avenue

Property Owner:

Guppy LLC

Applicant:

Denise Cravy, LCA Architecture

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

# 6.4 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-48:

# 910 4th Street

Historic District:

Northwest

Requested action:

**New Construction** 

Location:

910 4th Street

Property Owner:

ATB Management LLC

Applicant:

Denise Cravy, LCA Architecture

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

## 6.5 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-50:

# 3222 Windsor Avenue

Historic District:

Northwood Hills

Requested action:

Alterations – Carport Closure

Location:

3222 Windsor Avenue

Property Owner:

Essie Williams

Applicant:

Essie Williams

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg **made a motion to APPROVE** Consent <u>Case No. 20-17A</u>, 106 Roosevelt Place, <u>Case No. 22-44</u>, 205 Greymon Drive, <u>Case No. 22-47</u>, 3301 Greenwood Avenue, <u>Case No. 22-48</u>, 910 4<sup>th</sup> Street, <u>Case No. 22-50</u>, 3222 Windsor Avenue.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

HPB Case 22-46 was pulled from Content Case and will be heard independently.

# 1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-46:

#### 3707 Merrill Avenue

Historic District:

Vedado/Hillcrest

Requested Action:

**New Construction** 

Location:

3707 Merrill Avenue

Property Owner:

Albert Heal

Applicant:

Albert Heal

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Ernesto Ramos (family member) on behalf of the Applicant

The applicant is requesting a Certificate or Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. New Construction of a one-story Masonry Vernacular style sing-family home of approximately 2160 square feet

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-46.

The property at Merrill Avenue is in the Vedado/Hillcrest Historic District, consisting of a 0.1262acre vacant lot that was recently created through a lot split. The proposed front east elevation features an antique stucco finish and a recessed covered porch with a white front door and with sidelights. On either side are two sets of single hung windows in a 4 over 4 pattern with decorative shutters. The proposed north and south side elevations will feature a mixture of single hung windows in various sizes. The proposed rear west elevation will feature a full lite French door, a large single hung window set in a recessed rear porch, as well as a small single hung window with 4 lites.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comments.

There were no further public comments provided.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a motion to Approve <u>Case No. 22-46</u> with condition(s):

- 1. All windows shall feature the 4 over 4 grid pattern and shall have external, dimensional muntins with either a pyramid or ogee profile. All street or sidewalk facing glass shall be clear. All non-street facing glass shall be clear or clear with low e coating.
- 2. All shutters shall be proportionately sized and shall measure the full height and one-half the width of the window frame. Appropriate materials for shutters shall be composite, wood or aluminum.
- 3. The large single hung window on the west elevation shall be split into two equally sized smaller single-hung windows to better match the proportions of the fenestration on the other elevations.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

## VII CONTINUED CASES

7.1 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-17:</u>
 2501 S. Flagler Drive
 CONTINUED TO JULY MEETING

Historic District:

El Cid

Requested Action:

New Construction

Location:

2501 S. Flagler Dr.

Property Owner:

2501 S. Flagler Drive, LLC.

Applicant:

Daniel A. Menard

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

# 7.2 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-31 & 22-52</u>:

## 241 Plymouth Road

Historic District:

Belair

Requested Action:

Ad Valorem Preconstruction/Additions/Variance

Location:

241 Plymouth Road

Property Owner:

Abigail and Ian Zinn

Applicant:

Smith Kellogg Architecture, Inc

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Due to conflict of interest Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg exited Commission Chambers prior to cases being heard.

Presentation given by Taylor Smith and Todd McClain

The applicant is requesting an Ad Valorem Preconstruction and Variance approval for the following:

- 1. HPB Case 22-31: Construction of a second-floor addition of approximately 964SF and a connection piece between the existing primary and accessory structure of approximately 696SF.
- 2. HPB Case 22-52: A 10'3" setback at the closet points of the existing structure vs. the required 12' due to the constraints of the existing building and that by connecting them it is now considered a primary structure vs. and accessory.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board <u>Case No. 22-31</u> and <u>Case No. 22-52</u>.

The subject property is 0.275 acres located mid-block on the north side of Plymouth Road. The property is zoned Historic Single-family High Density (SF14-C2) Residential and is located within the Belair Historic District. The subject property contains a contributing two-story single-family home and a two-story accessory structure on the parcel.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a motion to Approve of Case No. 22-52 for a Variance.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-31 for Ad Valorem

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

## 7.3 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-35:

## 2407 Florida Avenue

Historic District:

Sunshine Park

Requested Action:

Demolition/New Construction

Location:

2407 Florida Avenue

Property Owner:

Newark Investors LLC

Applicant:

All Purpose Construction

Case Manager:

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1428; Email: amhamilton@wpb.org

Presentation by Jessica B on behalf of applicant.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

- 1. Demolition of existing garage structure.
- 2. Construction of a new one-story single-family home of approximately 2,131SF with a detached one-story accessory structure of approximately 308SF both in a contemporary style with cues taken from art deco architecture.
- 3. Site work

Ms. Anne Hamilton presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-35

Continued from the May 24<sup>th</sup> meeting. This is a non-contributing structure in the Sunshine Park Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Dan Pichney made a **motion to Approve** of Case No. 22-35 Demolition.

Mr. Ken Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

Mr. Dan Pichney made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-35 for New construction

Mr. Ken Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

# 7.4 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-37</u>:

## 221 Greenwood Drive

Historic District: Prospe

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested Action:

Alterations

Location:

221 Greenwood Dive

Property Owner:

James & Noelle Hughes

Applicant:

Polly Daugherty

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation given by Polly Daugherty on behalf of owners.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

1. A classic metal shingle roof silver in color.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board <u>Case No. 22-37</u>.

Continued from the May 24<sup>th</sup> meeting. The property at 221 Greenwood Drive is a two-story Frame Vernacular residence with Colonial influences built in 1939 by W.A. Holley and is known as the Alfred and Lucie Jackson House. It is a contributing building located in the Prospect Park/Southland Park Historic District.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-37.

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-37.

# 7.5 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-41:

230 Valencia Road

Historic District:

El Cid

Requested Action:

Alterations/Additions

Location:

230 Valencia Road

Property Owner:

Gayfryd Steinberg

Applicant:

Andrew Kirschner

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by Andrew Kirschner.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

- 1. Addition of second floor bathroom.
- 2. Remodeling the garage including a smaller garage door and adding a shed roof.
- 3. Adding a trellis between house and garage.
- 4. Replacing windows and doors
- 5. New site work including pool and hardscape.
- 6. Remodeling interior
- 7. Adding exterior fireplace.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-41.

This Mediterranean Revival property built in 1926 by A.B. Carter contributes significantly to the El Cid Historic District. Both the primary and accessory detached garage are listed as contributing. Barrel tile, Juliet balconies and turned columns are some of the typical character defining features.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg **made a motion to Approve** <u>Case No. 22-41</u> with the following condition(s):

- 1. Change quatrefoil windows to a larger vertical window.
- 2. Use option 1 with the existing shed roof on the first-floor element maintained.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

## VII NEW BUSINESS

## 8.1 Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-51:

## 741 Kanuga Drive

Historic District:

Flamingo Park

Requested Action:

Alterations

Location:

741 Kanuga Drive

Property Owner:

Ansell Borgess

Applicant:

Daniel Usher

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by Ryan Wagner on behalf of the applicant.

The applicant requesting approval for the following:

- 1. Reconstruction of garage in previous location (5'- 0" side setback) with expansion to back by approximately 393SF additional.
- 2. Addition of three transom windows in enclosed porch raising the non-original ceiling height.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-51.

The property at 741 Kanuga Drive is a one-story Frame Vernacular residence with two front facing gables and an enclosed porch in the middle. Off to the west was a one car garage with a shed roof.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-51.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0.

# 8.2 <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-45:</u>

## 2527 S Flagler Drive

Historic District:

Prospect/Southland Park

Requested Action:

Ad Valorem Preconstruction; Alterations/New Accessory

Location:

2527 S. Flagler Drive

Property Owner:

Pershing Way LLC, John Ford

Applicant:

David Lawrence

Case Manager:

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ph: 561-822-1457; Email: fmittner@wpb.org

Presentation by David Lawrence on behalf of the applicant.

The applicant requesting an Ad Valorem Preconstruction approval for the following:

- 1. Restoration of the "General's House" based on pictorial evidence including removal of later additions such as the octagonal extension of the dining room.
- 2. Construction of a new accessory structure in the southeast corner of the lot.
- 3. Site work.

Mrs. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 22-45.

This is a prominent property along South Flagler Drive. The existing Mediterranean Revival house on site contributes to the El Cid Historic District and was built in 1925 and is credited to architect W.B. Eckler.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

Raymond Masciarella – 195 Pershing Way - Opposed

Karen Masciarella – 195 Pershing Way - Opposed

Karen Stilling – El Cid Neighborhood Association Co-President. – Approving, however concerned about sub-terrain garage

John Ford – Property owner

Lynn Gray – address unknown – Approving

There were no further public comments provide.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Reginald Stambaugh made a motion to Approve Case No. 22-45.

Mr. Dan Pichney **seconded the motion; the motion passed** 4-2. Chairperson Amanda Skier opposed. Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg opposed.

# Adjournment

Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 6-0

Chairperson Amanda Skier adjourned the meeting at approximately 7:30 P.M.

Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

Chairperson (or designee)