Historic Preservation Board December 16, 2020 Meeting Minutes Via Zoom Conferencing

Due to the COVID-19 virus, and pursuant to the City of West Palm Beach's Executive Orders 2020-05 and 2020-09, the December 16, 2020, Historic Preservation Board meeting was held virtually with Board members, Staff, and applicants participating via Zoom video conferencing.

The Public Hearing was streamed live and available for viewing in the City Commission Chambers located at City Center - 401 Clematis Street, and the ability to make public comment was available in the adjacent Flagler Gallery.

Access to the meeting was also available remotely through Zoom, as well as the City's other usual media channels. Those participating remotely and wishing to make public comment were able to do so through voicemail, email, online form submittal, or directly through Zoom.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Amanda Skier, Chairperson

Dan Pichney, Member

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member Kenneth Breslauer, Member Nicholas Kassatly, Member

MEMBERS ABSENT: Kristin Kellogg, Vice-Chairperson

Reginald Stambaugh, Member Keith Williams, 1st Alternate

STAFF PRESENT: Rick Greene, Development Services Director

Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Ana Aponte, City Urban Designer John Roach, Principal Planner

Aaron Borngraber, Historic Preservation Planner

Hope White, Board Secretary

BOARD ATTORNEY: Denise Haire, Assistant City Attorney

I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chairperson Amanda Skier, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:04 P.M. Hope White, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to approve the Agenda.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a **motion to approve** the Agenda for December 16, 2020.

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer seconded the motion; **the motion passed** 5-0. Chairperson Amanda Skier then asked for approval of the Minutes of November 18, 2020.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a **motion to approve** the Minutes for November 18, 2020. Mr. Nick Kassatly **seconded the motion**; **the motion passed** 5-0.

III. REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

Ms. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, reported that since the last meeting of November 2020, Staff had reviewed 109 Level I applications and 36 zoning reviews.

IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier read into the record the Script for the Virtual Public Meeting (this is an excerpt from the Script). Pursuant to Mayor Keith A. James' Executive Order No. 2020-05 issued on April 2nd, 2020, the City of West Palm Beach's Boards and Committees are conducting meetings through media technology and have released the requirements to have a quorum of its members physically present at City Hall.

On April 14th, 2020, Mayor Keith A. James issued Executive Order No. 2020-09, which specifically provides the rules of procedure for conducting City Meetings, including requirements for quasi-judicial hearings.

After the applicant presents their case, Staff will provide a presentation and then the public will have an opportunity to speak or have their comments read into the record from previously received correspondence. The Board will then go into executive session. Prior to rendering a decision, the Board will confirm no additional public comments have been received by Staff.

A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier disclosed that she had spoken with Ms. Mittner regarding the cases on the Agenda for the meeting, but that she can make her decisions based upon the evidence presented.

V. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public requested to speak on items not listed on the Agenda.

A. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS

Ms. White, Board Secretary, swore in all members of the public who wished to speak.

VI. CONSENT CASES

1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-75: 709 Avon Road

The property at 709 Avon Road is in the Flamingo Park Historic District, consisting of a contributing primary house and accessory structure both built in 1925 in the Mission Revival style.

This classic courtyard house has a similar one on Biscayne. A mix of parapet and hip roofs, a courtyard wall and arches are the character defining features. Except for the front door the windows are all replacements.

The applicant is requesting a preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for the following:

- 1. Addition of powder room to main house.
- 2. Addition of 2nd full bath.
- 3. Add French Doors facing the street in place of existing paired windows.
- 4. Accessory structure loggia addition and door modification.
- 5. Site work including low perimeter wall.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL with the following conditions:

- 1. The replacement of the front pair of windows shall be accomplished in a single pair of French Doors to retain the same opening width.
- 2. The rear loggia has regular arches not Moorish arches.
- 3. The garage doors shall be retained but glass doors can be added behind, a similar shutter/door system shall be installed in the other bay.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** Consent <u>Case No. 20-75</u>, for Ad Valorem – preconstruction and alterations at 709 Avon Road.

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

I. CONTINUED CASES

None.

II. NEW BUSINESS

1. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-74</u>: 284 Cordova Road, Additions/Alterations.

Raphael Saladrigas, the applicant's representative, gave a presentation.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-74.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the application with the following conditions for full compliance:

- 1. The second-story windows identified as C in Bedroom 1 and E in Home Office shall maintain their current existing size.
- 2. All windows shall feature an inset of a minimum of one inch from the exterior stucco finish and all mullions with a double-hung window shall be at least four-inches wide.
- 3. All street facing glass shall be Clear only. Non-street glass shall be Clear or Clear with Low-E coating.
- 4. All tile shall be barrel, and all brackets and columns shall be made of wood.
- 5. The front two flat roof sections shall have a barrel tile coping added.
- 6. The geometric-like dome shall have an exterior made of copper to naturally patina.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Aaron stated he received public comments from Nancy Pullum, and an email with concerns regarding the front elevations. He indicated that he and Ms. Mittner addressed the concerns, by telephone.

There was additional discussion between the Board, Staff and the applicant's representative regarding the surrounds.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a **motion to approve** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 20-74</u>, for additions and alterations, in accordance with Standards 9 and 10, as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation, and the compatibility criteria as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The conditions include the following:

- 1. The second-story windows identified as C in Bedroom 1 and E in Home Office shall maintain their current existing size.
- 2. All windows shall feature an inset of a minimum of one inch from the

- exterior stucco finish and all mullions with a double-hung window shall be at least four-inches wide. All street facing glass shall be Clear only. Non-street glass shall be Clear or Clear with Low-E coating.
- 3. All street facing glass shall be Clear only. Non-street glass shall be Clear or Clear with Low-E coating.
- 4. All tile shall be barrel, and all brackets and columns shall be made of wood.
- 5. The front two flat roof sections shall have a barrel tile coping added.
- 6. The geometric-like dome shall have an exterior made of copper to naturally patina.

Mr. Nick Kassatly seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

2. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-76</u>: 620 3rd Street, "the Grand"-New construction of multi-family/mixed use development of multiple building types including a 6-story garage.

The 2.3793-acre site that is currently identified with just the singular address of 620 3rd Street has a small portion at the northwest corner that falls within the Northwest Historic District. A development of significant size is proposed that includes multiple buildings, uses and a six-story parking garage. The portion that falls into the historic district is approximately 100 feet of frontage on 3rd Street down to the alley (proposed for abandonment) and a square parcel fronting North Sapodilla Avenue. The project is referred to as "the Grand" in reference to the Grand theater that once stood on Rosemary and 4th Street.

Recent modifications to the incentive map allow NWD-8 for affordable housing, therefore the proposal meets zoning requirements as adopted under the Downtown Master Plan.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. Construction of a multi building, mixed use development of 309 residential units and approximately 3,637 SF of retail and a six-story parking garage. Specifically, two 3-story units that face north, the stairwell behind, the vacant lot entrance to the garage and an approximately 100' x100' portion of the northwest corner of the six- floor parking garage.

Harvey E. Oyer III, with Shutts & Bowen, LLP, provided a brief introduction.

Jeff Burns, Harvey Oyer, and Beatriz Hernandez, the applicant's representatives, gave presentations.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-76.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with the following

conditions:

- 1. The geometric diagonal score line and paint scheme shall be eliminated from the western portion of the 3-story building facing 3rd Street (as identified as #13 on sheet A-3.2). This shall be replaced with vertical score lines spaced per the fluting of the Grand Theatre.
- 2. The three western units facing 3rd Street (A1, A2, B1) shall features stairs and gates to access directly from the street with a swinging door not a slider (shown in plan but not reflected clearly on elevations).
- 3. All windows including corner windows as depicted in elevations of northwest stairwell shall be actual windows (not clearly reflected in plan).
- 4. All fenestration within historic district that faces 3rd Street or North Sapodilla shall feature black, white or galvanized aluminum frames with clear glass (no tint or low e) and pyramidal dimensional exterior muntins.
- 5. Garage modifications to provide for a compatible transition, appropriate size and scale and architectural elements shall include: utilizing breeze blocks in the entire rectangle above the garage entrance (elevations appear to be screen), change openings on garage to be vertically oriented for portion in district facing Sapodilla, utilize actual splashy glazed tile (proposed for other areas of project) at base of garage facing Sapodilla at least 7' tall and 25' in either direction of garage entrance, eliminate trellis on top of garage for all portions within historic district and eliminate 6 floor parking floor north of Stair #2 (per plan looks like this will impact five parking spaces) to provide a visual transition.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

There were no members of the public who provided public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Dan Pichney made a **motion to approve** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 20-76</u>, for new construction, in accordance with the Security of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10, as well as the additional compatibility criteria as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations. The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation. The conditions include the following:

- 1. The geometric diagonal score line and paint scheme shall be eliminated from the western portion of the 3-story building facing 3rd Street (as identified as #13 on sheet A-3.2). This shall be replaced with vertical score lines spaced per the fluting of the Grand Theatre.
- 2. The three western units facing 3rd Street (A1, A2, B1) shall features stairs and gates to access directly from the street with a swinging door not a slider (shown in plan but not reflected clearly on elevations).
- 3. All windows including corner windows as depicted in elevations of northwest stairwell shall be actual windows (not clearly reflected in plan).
- 4. All fenestration within historic district that faces 3rd Street or North Sapodilla shall feature black, white or galvanized aluminum frames with clear glass (no tint or low e) and pyramidal dimensional exterior muntins.
- 5. Garage modifications to provide for a compatible transition, appropriate size and scale and architectural elements shall include: utilizing breeze blocks in the entire rectangle above the garage entrance (elevations appear to be screen), change openings on garage to be vertically oriented for portion in district facing Sapodilla, utilize actual splashy glazed tile (proposed for other areas of project) at base of garage facing Sapodilla at least 7' tall and 25' in either direction of garage entrance, eliminate trellis on top of garage for all portions within historic district and eliminate 6 floor parking floor north of Stair #2 (per plan looks like this will impact five parking spaces) to provide a visual transition.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 5-0.

A. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

B. ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Amanda Skier adjourned the meeting at approximately 6:45 P.M.

Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

* * * * *

This s	ignature	is to	attest	that the	undersi	gned is	the C	hairpersor	ı, or d	esignee,	of the	Historic
Prese	rvation	Board	l Meet	ting and	that th	e inform	nation	provided	herein	n is the	true and	correct
Minutes for the December 16, 2020, meeting of the Historic Preservation Board Meeting, dated												
this _	4m	day of	f	Marci	h		_, 202	1.				

Chairperson (or designee)