# Historic Preservation Board October 26, 2021 Meeting Minutes Commission Chambers

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Kristin Kellogg, Vice-Chairperson

Dan Pichney, Member

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member Kenneth Breslauer, Member Reginald Stambaugh, Member Keith Williams, Member

Donna Tomaszewski, 1<sup>st</sup> Alternate

MEMBERS ABSENT: Amanda Skier, Chairperson

**STAFF PRESENT:** Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Anne Hamilton, Historic Preservation Planner

Hope White, Board Secretary

**BOARD ATTORNEY:** Ms. Arlene Franconero, Assistant City Attorney

# I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:05 P.M. Hope White, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

# II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Due to the absence of Chairperson Amanda Skier, Ms. Donna Tomaszewski became a voting member.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg requested a motion to approve the Agenda.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a **motion to approve** the Agenda for October 26, 2021. Mr. Keith Williams seconded the motion; **the motion passed** 7-0.

Ms. Mittner indicated that the August 2021 Minutes were provided for reference; minor corrections were made by Ms. White.

Vice-Chairperson Kellogg then asked if there were any changes to the Minutes of the September 28, 2021 meeting.

Mr. Keith Williams made a motion to approve the Minutes for September 28, 2021.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

## III. REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

Ms. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, introduced Anne Hamilton, the new Historic Preservation Planner. She reminded Board members that the next meeting would be held on Wednesday, November 17, 2021. Ms. Mittner reported that since the last meeting of September 2021, Staff had reviewed 142 Level I applications, 2 Level II applications, and 13 zoning reviews.

# IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg stated that the matters before the public are quasi-judicial in nature. The decisions of the Board are made from competent and substantial evidence that comes before them. For each case, after the applicant presents their case, Staff will provide a presentation and then the public will have an opportunity to speak or have their comments read into the record from previously received correspondence. The applicant can make a 10-minute presentation for regular cases or take 15 minutes for a proposed demolition. After Staff's presentation, the Board will open up the floor for public comment, which is restricted to three minutes per speaker. The applicant may have a short rebuttal after the public speaks. The Board will then go into executive session. Prior to rendering a decision, the Board will confirm no additional public comments have been received by Staff. Members of the Board need to disclose if they have discussed the cases with anyone prior to tonight's meeting.

## A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

- Ms. Donna Tomaszewski None.
- Mr. Keith Williams disclosed he had communications regarding <u>HPB Case No.</u> 21-85 at 3119 Spruce Avenue, with the owner and applicant.
- Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky disclosed that he contacted by the applicants of <u>HPB</u> Case Nos. 21-84, 21-85.
- Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg disclosed she had spoken with Ms.
   Friederike Mittner regarding cases on the agenda, but that she would make her decisions based upon the evidence presented.
- Mr. Daniel Pichney None.
- Mr. Ken Breslauer None.
- Mr. Reginald Stambaugh None.

## V. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

# A. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS

Ms. Hope White, Board Secretary, swore in Staff and members of the public who wished to speak.

#### VI. CONSENT CASES

# 1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 17-75C: 509 38th Street

This one-story Vernacular structure was constructed in 1942 and is located towards the rear of the lot. No information is available indicating that a structure was previously located towards the front of the lot. The subject property is located in the Northboro Park Historic District. The character defining features include a painted brick exterior and a flat roof.

On February 27, 2018, the applicant received approval for the following:

- 1. Replace non-original windows and doors with aluminum single pane windows.
- 2. Construct an approximately 1,940 square foot new construction towards the front of the lot. This two-story mid-century structure would feature a flat roof, modern windows and a base of painted brick. The remaining exterior finish would be smooth stucco.
- 3. Site work.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the completed work application.

# 2. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-81: 744 Sunset Road

This parcel consists of two structures, a Vernacular style home facing Sunset Road and an accessory structure facing Lake Avenue. Both buildings contribute to the Flamingo Park Historic District and were built circa 1937. This application is only requesting modifications to the accessory structure.

The applicant is requesting a preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for:

- 1. Second floor addition of approximately 500 square feet immediately above existing two car garage. Horizontal siding will be utilized, and the addition features a street facing gable.
- 2. Site work.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application.

# **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** Consent <u>Case No. 17-75C</u>, at 509 38<sup>th</sup> Street, and <u>Case No. 21-81</u>, at 744 Sunset Road.

Mr. Keith Williams seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

#### VII. CONTINUED CASES

1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-68: 2415 S. Flagler Drive

This case was continued to the November 17, 2021 meeting at the request of the applicant.

# VIII. NEW BUSINESS

1. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-82</u>: 345 Marlborough Place This uniquely pie-shaped lot is in the Prospect Park/Southland Park Historic District. The house was built in 1945 in the Colonial Revival style by R.A. Baldwin and contributes to the historic district.

The applicant is requesting a Preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for:

- 1. Second floor addition of approximately 616 SF immediately above existing one- story portion of house. Horizontal siding and 6/6 single hung windows proposed.
- 2. Window and door modifications to 6/6 single hung either single or paired.
- 3. Later front entry and rear porch phases indicated.
- 4. Site work.

Ms. Denise S. Cravy, the applicant, gave a presentation.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-82</u>.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Dan Pichney **made a motion to APPROVE** <u>HPB Case No. 21-82</u>, at 345 Marlborough Place, for alterations, additions, Ad Valorem Preconstruction in accordance with Standards 9 and 10 as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence.

Mr. Keith Williams seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

2. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-83: 515 Kanuga Drive

This application was converted to Staff Review.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to MOVE this application to the end of the agenda [due to the applicant not being present]. However, this item remained in its original position for purposes of the numerical order for the Minutes.

Mr. Keith Williams seconded the motion; the motion passed, 7-0.

3. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-84</u>: 115 Westminster Road This American Foursquare house was built in 1921 by V.S. Hall and contributes to the Prospect Park/Southland Park Historic District. Character defining features include horizontal and shake siding, deep eaves and a mix of 6/1 and diamond patterned windows.

The applicant is requesting a Preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for:

- 1. Addition of approximately 458 square foot one-story master bedroom suite to east side of house.
- 2. Metal siding to be replaced with wood on original house.
- 3. Ground floor window replacements.

Polly Daugherty, the applicant's representative, gave a presentation.

Evan Speiser, the applicant, gave a presentation.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-84.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the application with the condition that the diamond patterned window and those in the bay window opening shall be retained.

City Staff amended the condition of approval, in light of the fact that there was such a mix [already] of impact windows. Staff recommended a straight APPROVAL.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public provided public comments.

# **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-84</u>, at 115 Westminster Road, for Ad Valorem Preconstruction, additions and alterations in accordance with Standards 9 and 10 as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence.

# Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

4. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-85</u>: 3119 Spruce Avenue On October 23, 2018, the Historic Preservation Board approved significant additions, modifications and new construction of an accessory structure for this property. Since then the applicant has not initiated any of those improvements.

This contributing Frame Vernacular property located on the southwest corner of 31<sup>St</sup> Street and Spruce Avenue was built in 1922 by C. J. Trevail. In the 1970's it had a linear addition constructed to the west along the 31<sup>St</sup> street side. Character defining features include a columned front porch. Arched entry and arched windows on the first floor face the east, while on other elevations and the second floor the windows have a square top. The property is located in the heart of the old Northwood Historic District and has unfortunately stood in a state of disrepair for quite some time.

The applicant is now requesting approval for:

- 1. Demolition of existing structure.
- 2. Reconstruction of property with previously approved additions.
- 3. Construction of detached accessory structure.
- 4. Site work

Iulia Darabant, the applicant, gave a presentation.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-85.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the request with the following conditions:

- 1. The bricks from the chimney shall be salvaged and reused in reconstruction of the chimney
- 2. All usable wood on site including structural pieces shall be salvaged and reused during reconstruction.
- 3. All windows shall have a multi-lite dimensional ogee muntin pattern.
- 4. All setbacks shall be met including 15' off Spruce and the alley and 25' off 31st Street.
- 5. Three off street parking spaces shall be provided.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg opened the floor to public comment.

Ms. White read into the record many of the public comments in support of the application. There were approximately fourteen (14) public comments in support of the application to include nine (9) emails, three (3) voicemails, and two (2) text messages; one (1) in opposition.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Keith Williams **made a motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-85</u>, at 3119 Spruce Avenue, for demolition in accordance with the Demolition Guidelines as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

Mr. Keith Williams made another motion to APPROVE Historic Preservation Case No. 21-85, at 3119 Spruce Avenue, for New Construction in accordance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically, Standards 9 and 10 as well as the Additional Compatibility Criteria set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations, and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as well as the additional compatibility criteria as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The conditions include the following:

- 1. The bricks from the chimney shall be salvaged and reused in reconstruction of the chimney.
- 2. All usable wood on site including structural pieces shall be salvaged and reused during reconstruction.
- 3. All windows shall have a multi-lite dimensional ogee muntin pattern.
- 4. All setbacks shall be met including 15' off Spruce and the alley and 25' off 31st Street.
- 5. Three off street parking spaces shall be provided.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **seconded the motion**; **the motion passed** 7-0.

5. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-86: 4008 Greenwood Avenue

This application was continued to the November 17, 2021 meeting.

6. **Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-87**: 4010 Greenwood Avenue

This application was continued to the November 17, 2021 meeting.

7. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-89: 294 Cordova Road

This application was withdrawn by the applicant.

# IX. ADJOURNMENT

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg adjourned the meeting at approximately 6:14 P.M. Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

\* \* \* \* \*

This signature is to attest that the undersit	igned is the Chairperson, or designee, of the Historic
Preservation Board Meeting and that the	ne information provided herein is the true and correc
Minutes for the October 26, 2021, meetin	ng of the Historic Preservation Board Meeting, dated
this 17th day of November	ng of the <b>Historic Preservation Board Meeting</b> , dated, 2021.

Chairperson (or designee)