Historic Preservation Board March 24, 2020 Meeting Minutes **Commission Chambers**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Amanda Skier, Chairperson (via Teleconference)

Theodora Aspegren, Vice-Chairperson (via Teleconference)

Kristin Kellogg, Member (via Teleconference) Dan Pichney, Member (via Teleconference)

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member (via Teleconference)

Kenneth Breslauer, Member

Reginald Stambaugh, 1st Alternate (via Teleconference)

MEMBERS ABSENT: TaCara Chambers, Member

Nicholas Kassatly, 2nd Alternate

STAFF PRESENT: Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Aaron Borngraber, Historic Preservation Planner

Hope White, Board Secretary

BOARD ATTORNEY: Farah Nerette, Assistant City Attorney

I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chairperson Amanda Skier, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:00 P.M., via Zoom video conferencing. Hope White, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Chairperson Amanda Skier requested a motion to approve the Agenda. Vice-Chairperson Theodora Aspegren made a motion to approve the Agenda for March 24, 2020. Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

Chairperson Amanda Skier then asked for approval of the Minutes of February 25, 2020. Ms. Kristin Kellogg made a motion to approve the Minutes for February 25, 2020. Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

III. REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

Ms. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, informed Board members that since the last meeting of February 2020, Staff had reviewed 110 Level I applications, 33 zoning reviews, and 4 Level II applications.

IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier stated that the matters before the public are quasi-judicial in nature. The decisions of the Board are made from competent and substantial evidence that comes before them. For each case, the applicant can make a 10-minute presentation for regular cases or take 15 minutes for a proposed demolition, followed by a presentation by City Staff. The Board will then open up the floor for public comment, which is restricted to three minutes per speaker. The applicant may have a short rebuttal after the public speaks. Members of the Board need to disclose if they have discussed the cases with anyone prior to tonight's meeting.

A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier disclosed that she had spoken with Ms. Mittner regarding all of the cases on the Agenda for the meeting, but that she would make her decisions based upon the evidence presented at the meeting.

V. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public requested to speak on items not listed on the Agenda.

A. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS

Ms. White, Board Secretary, swore in all members of the public who wished to speak.

VI. CONSENT CASES

None.

VII. CONTINUED BUSINESS

1. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-04</u>, 315 Dyer Road, Demolition; Accessory Structure.

The property at 315 Dyer Road is located in the El Cid Historic District, consisting of a contributing primary two story Mediterranean Revival structure known as the Emilie & Gertrude Anthony House built by V.S. Hall in 1924 and a two-story contributing accessory structure built in 1924. The applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. Proposed demolition of the contributing accessory structure built in 1924, citing airborne smoke by-products air sampling report.

The applicant, Mr. Paul Darrow, presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case Nos. 20-04 and 20-15</u>, simultaneously. Mrs. Jody Darrow read into the record, a letter from her neighbor.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case Nos.</u> <u>20-04 and 20-15</u>, simultaneously.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with conditions.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

The Chair opened the floor to public comment.

One member of the public came forward for public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a **motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No.</u> <u>20-04</u>, for demolition in accordance with the Demolition Guidelines as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based on the testimony presented along with the application submitted and the Staff Report, which constitute competent, substantial evidence.

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 7-0.

VIII. NEW BUSINESS

1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-15, 315 Dyer Road

The property at 315 Dyer Road is located in the El Cid Historic District, consisting of a contributing primary two story Mediterranean Revival structure known as the Emilie & Gertrude Anthony House built by V.S. Hall in 1924 and a two-story contributing accessory structure built in 1924.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

- 1. Proposed new construction of a two-story accessory structure with a two-car garage and a garage accessory apartment of approximately 999 square feet.
- 2. Ad Valorem Preconstruction for proposed additions to the rear of

the primary structure for a new family room, extended nook, and storage of approximately 366 square feet and a covered patio of approximately 210 square feet, with a second- floor expanded terrace.

Note: This request was heard in conjunction with the previous submittal of HPB 20-04 for demolition of a contributing accessory structure.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with conditions.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public came forward for public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer made a **motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-15</u>, for new construction in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10 as well as the Additional Compatibility Criteria set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based on the testimony presented along with the application submitted and the Staff Report, which constitute competent, substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations, and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10. The Additional Compatibility Criteria set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs), specifically, Criteria (c)4(a) 1-9. The conditions included the following:

- 1. The applicant shall reduce the wall height of the accessory structure by six inches or move the accessory structure eastward by six inches.
- 2. The applicant shall add two additional windows to the west elevation. One approximately in the upper left corner. One approximately in the lower right corner.
- 3. The applicant shall install a Mediterranean Revival appropriate garage door with the visual appearance of vertical wood planking.
- 4. The applicant shall install windows with a 4/4 or 6/6 window configuration with external dimensional ogee muntins, or reuse the existing 1/1/ windows in the structure and apply muntins. (*revised condition*)
- 5. The accessory structure shall feature a slightly textured stucco finish.

Ms. Theodora Aspegren seconded the motion; the motion PASSED 7-0.

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer made another **motion to APPROVE** Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-15, for alterations in accordance with Standards as set forth in Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based on the testimony presented along with the application submitted and the Staff Report, which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations, and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10. The Additional Compatibility Criteria set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs), specifically, Criteria (c)4(a) 1-9. The conditions include the following:

- 1. The addition shall feature a score line to differentiate the addition from the current existing structure. The addition shall feature a slightly less textured stucco finish than the current stucco finish on the existing structure.
- 2. The chimney shall be redesigned to feature a tapered cap.

Ms. Theodora Aspegren seconded the motion; the motion PASSED 7-0.

2. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-17</u>, 106 Roosevelt Place, New Construction (Lot 3 split from 112 Roosevelt Place).

The applicant, Mr. Zdravko Mesaric, made presentations.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-17. The subject property is vacant lot three (3) that was subdivided from the parcel immediately to the west in the Prospect Park/Southland Park Historic District.

The applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the following:

1. New construction of a two-story Mediterranean Revival house of approximately 3,629 square feet which includes a detached rear single-story two car garage. The ground floor of the house features a living room, dining room, kitchen, family room and master bedroom suite. On the second floor there are two bedrooms with bathroom and a master suite. Exterior spaces include a covered loggia, pool, spa area and balconies.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with conditions.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public came forward for public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a **motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-17</u>, for new construction in accordance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10, as well as the additional compatibility criteria as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation, and additional criteria as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs), specifically criteria 4(a). The conditions included the following:

- 1. A more traditional Mediterranean Revival style metal railing shall be submitted for staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 2. The front door header shall match the adjacent. (added condition)

Vice-Chairperson Theodora Aspegren seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 7-0.

3. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-20</u>, 801 Claremore Drive, Alterations; Windows Frame Color.

The applicant, Mr. James Fitzmaurice, made presentations.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-20. The subject site is a corner lot in the Flamingo Park Historic District. This contributing property was built in 1953 by Zimmerman of Lake Worth in the Modern style. The structure's character defining features include the flat sloped roofs, the various boxes that make up the composition of the building and a unique site wall. On March 26, 2019 the applicant received approval from the Historic Preservation Board (HPB 19-16) for: removal of non-original screen porch; window and door modifications including opening sizes and locations; addition of approximately 1,085 square feet for living room; master bedroom suite and additional bedroom; and interior and site modifications. During the course of the project the applicant changed window frame colors from the approved anodized aluminum to a dark bronze due to a cost savings.

The applicant requested approval for the following:

1. Change the window and door frame color to the already installed dark bronze.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the application with conditions. The condition included the following:

1. The Ad Valorem for the project shall be reduced to a five-year benefit.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public came forward for public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Ms. Kellogg recalled the project coming before the Board in 2019. The Board recognized it being very unique for the applicant to be willing to make such a great investment to restore a house of this style. She stated that no Historic material had been lost and that the Historic District has gained a tremendous asset with all of the work that had been completed on the project. Ms. Kellogg indicated that she did not support the full 10 years, and indicated the applicant deserved more than 5 years because they were not taking away any Historic material; the project was in greater conformity of the original design intent.

Chairperson Skier concurred with Ms. Kellogg's comments and inquired if the Board should wait until the project was completed. Ms. Kellogg expressed that waiting would allow for the Board to ensure the project was in compliance.

Chairperson Skier asked for a motion to approve, removing Staff's suggested condition, with the understanding that the recommendation would be assessed at a later date.

Ms. Ken Breslauer made a **motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Board Case 20-20</u>, for alterations, in accordance with Standard 10 as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence.

Ms. Kristin Kellogg seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 7-0.

4. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-21</u>, 3217 Washington Road, Ad Valorem Preconstruction.

The applicant, Mr. Gregory Bonner, made presentations.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-21</u>. This property was constructed in 1925 in the Mission Revival Style and contributes to the Prospect Park/Southland Park Historic District. The site also has a detached contributing accessory structure. The applicant requested approval for the following:

1. A two-story addition of approximately 1,043 square feet to the west of primary structure which would include a dining room, family room and expanded kitchen on the ground floor and a master bedroom suite on the second floor.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with conditions.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No members of the public came forward for public comments.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Ken Breslauer made a **motion to APPROVE** Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-21, for Ad Valorem Preconstruction, additions/alterations, in accordance with Standards 9 and 10 as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation, and additional compatibility criteria as set forth in Section 94-49, of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs). The conditions included the following:

- 1. The main house and accessory structure shall not be connected with a solid roof.
- 2. There will be a slight setback between the original structure and the addition. (*added condition*)

Vice-Chairperson Theodora Aspegren seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 7-0.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Mittner indicated that the Annual meeting occurs in the month of March, with the election of the Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson.

Ms. Theodora Aspegren made a motion nominating Ms. Kristin Kellogg for

Vice-Chairperson. Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 6-0.

Ms. Theodora Aspegren **made a motion nominating** Ms. Amanda Skier for Chairperson. Ms. Kristin Kellogg seconded the motion; the **motion PASSED** 6-0.

Ms. Mittner stated that during the Annual meeting, there was the opportunity for any concerns or suggested modifications to be presented to the rules and procedures. Staff would make those announcements and return with recommended language with changes, at the next meeting. There were no suggested changes or modifications by the Board.

X. ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Amanda Skier adjourned the meeting at approximately 6:14 P.M.

Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

* * * * *

This signature is to attest that the undersigned is the Chairperson, or designee, of the **Historic Preservation Board Meeting** and that the information provided herein is the true and correct Minutes for the **March 24, 2020**, meeting of the **Historic Preservation Board Meeting**, dated this ______ day of _______, 2020.

Chairperson (or designee)