# Historic Preservation Board January 26, 2021 Meeting Minutes Via Zoom Conferencing

Due to the COVID-19 virus, and pursuant to the City of West Palm Beach's Executive Orders 2020-05 and 2020-09, the January 26, 2021, Historic Preservation Board meeting was held virtually with Board members, Staff, and applicants participating via Zoom video conferencing.

The Public Hearing was streamed live and available for viewing in the City Commission Chambers located at City Center - 401 Clematis Street, and the ability to make public comment was available in the adjacent Flagler Gallery.

Access to the meeting was also available remotely through Zoom, as well as the City's other usual media channels. Those participating remotely and wishing to make public comment were able to do so through voicemail, email, online form submittal, or directly through Zoom.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Amanda Skier, Chairperson

Kristin Kellogg, Vice-Chairperson

Dan Pichney, Member

Gabriel Jaroslavsky, Member Kenneth Breslauer, Member Reginald Stambaugh, Member Nicholas Kassatly, Member

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** Keith Williams, 1<sup>st</sup> Alternate

**STAFF PRESENT:** Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner

Aaron Borngraber, Historic Preservation Planner

John Roach, Principal Planner Hope White, Board Secretary

**BOARD ATTORNEY:** Denise Haire, Assistant City Attorney

#### I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chairperson Amanda Skier, called the regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Board to order at 5:04 P.M. Hope White, Board Secretary, called the roll and it was determined that a quorum was present.

#### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/MINUTES

Chairperson Amanda Skier requested motions to approve the Agenda and Minutes. Ms. Friederike Mittner, Historic Preservation Planner, indicated that <u>Case No. 21-05</u> for 323 Westminster Place, was withdrawn at the applicant's request.

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a **motion to approve** the Agenda for January 26, 2021. Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky seconded the motion; **the motion passed** 7-0.

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky made a motion to approve the Minutes for December 16, 2020.

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

#### III. REPORT OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNER

Ms. Friederike Mittner, City Historic Preservation Planner, reported that since the last meeting of December 2020, Staff had reviewed 121 Level I applications and 54 zoning reviews.

#### IV. REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON/DECLARATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier read into the record the Script for the Virtual Public Meeting (this is an excerpt from the Script). Pursuant to Mayor Keith A. James' Executive Order No. 2020-05 issued on April 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2020, the City of West Palm Beach's Boards and Committees are conducting meetings through media technology and have released the requirements to have a quorum of its members physically present at City Hall.

On April 14<sup>th</sup>, 2020, Mayor Keith A. James issued Executive Order No. 2020-09, which specifically provides the rules of procedure for conducting City Meetings, including requirements for quasi-judicial hearings.

After the applicant presents their case, Staff will provide a presentation and then the public will have an opportunity to speak or have their comments read into the record from previously received correspondence. The Board will then go into executive session. Prior to rendering a decision, the Board will confirm no additional public comments have been received by Staff.

#### A. EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION

Chairperson Amanda Skier disclosed that she had spoken with Ms. Mittner regarding the cases on the Agenda for the meeting, but that she can make her decisions based upon the evidence presented.

#### V. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public requested to speak on items not listed on the Agenda.

#### A. SWEARING IN OF SPEAKERS

With the video conferencing procedures in place, Ms. Hope White, Board Secretary, swore in Staff and members of the public who wished to speak.

#### VI. CONSENT CASES

1. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-07: 446 37th Street

The property at 446 37<sup>th</sup> Street is in the Northboro Park Historic District, consisting of a contributing primary house and accessory structure both built circa 1940 in the Vernacular style.

The generally minimal traditional house and accessory structure have a Spanish S tile on the roof. The accessory structure is accessed off the alley way for the garage portion and sits off Spruce Avenue by approximately 60 feet.

The applicant is requesting a preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for the following:

1. Reconfigure roof on accessory structure to a single gable ended roof instead of a cross gable roof.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the application as submitted.

2. Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-77: 2018 Florida Avenue

This contributing property in Flamingo Park was built in 1925 in the Mission Revival style by Hansell Hall and is known as the William Bentsen House. It fronts Biscayne Drive and sits on a double lot, but the massing of the building is focused on Florida Avenue. The original open porch has been enclosed and windows have been replaced but features remain in keeping with the original.

The applicant is requesting a preconstruction Ad Valorem approval for the following:

- 1. Construct an approximately 437 SF addition on the east side of the property. This would house a new kitchen and dining room with a large covered porch. The addition would be one-story with a parapet roof but would project forward of the existing building line.
- 2. Add a pent roof over the existing front entry.
- 3. Site work including a pool, driveway and site wall.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with the following conditions:

- 1. The driveways shall be reduced to the maximum 20' total width per code.
- 2. The three small windows in the kitchen shall be slightly enlarged to match the size and style of the 4-lite pattern windows existing on the west elevation of the house.

#### EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** Consent <u>Case No. 21-07</u>, for Alterations-roof at 446 37<sup>th</sup> Street, and Consent <u>Case No. 20-77</u>, for Ad Valorem Preconstruction – additions/alterations at 2018 Florida Avenue.

Mr. Reginald Stambaugh seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

#### I. CONTINUED CASES

1. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 20-71</u>: 1220 N. Sapodilla Avenue N/A – Informational Purposes Only

Mr. Aaron Borngraber, Historic Preservation Planner, provided an update of the case. He indicated that it was approved at the December 2020 meeting for demolition. Mr. Borngraber stated that Genia Baker, CRA Project Manager, was looking into moving the building on the property, and waiting to obtain the numbers. He stated the case would possibly return to the Board.

#### II. NEW BUSINESS

- 1. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-01</u>: Northwood Hills Historic District, Resurvey. This application is for a redesignation of the Northwood Hills Historic District in the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places was requested by Northwood Hills Neighborhood Association. Staff attended a Northwood Hills Neighborhood Association Meeting on November 17, 2020 to explain the resurvey. The City of West Palm is required to maintain and update Historic Districts per Comprehensive Plan Historic Preservation Element Policies 1.1.5, 2.1.1, and 2.1.5.
  - **Policy 1.1.5:** The City will continue to evaluate its historic resources, both archaeological and within the built environment, for eligibility for nomination to the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places and the National Register of Historic Places.
  - **Policy 2.1.1:** The City will continue to maintain a local register of historic buildings, structures and sites.
  - **Policy 2.1.5:** The Historic Preservation Division Staff of the City will promote the designation process for properties eligible for listing on the Local or National Register, and will continue to provide technical assistance to constituents who express interestin designation.

Bob Beaulieu gave a brief presentation.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-01</u>.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL to the redesignation of Northwood Hills as

an Historic District. It meets Criteria A and C as described in Section 94-48 (a)(1) – Designation of historic properties, districts, and landmarks in the Zoning and Land Use Development Regulations of the City of West Palm Beach.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a motion to APPROVE <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-01</u>. This cause came to be heard on January 26, 2021, at a public hearing before the City of West Palm Beach Historic Preservation Board, on the application of the City of West Palm Beach, for the redesignation of Northwood Hills as a Historic District under Ordinance 4926-21. The Board, upon reviewing the report and recommendation of the Historic Preservation Planner and hearing testimony from the public on such application, makes the following Findings of Fact:

- 1. The Northwood Hills Historic District is historically significant for its association with events which contributed to the broad patterns of our history, particularly the residential development of West Palm Beach.
- 2. The Northwood Hills Historic District has a concentration of historically and architecturally significant residential structures with a period of significance that extends from 1925 to 1971.
- 3. The Northwood Hills Historic District has a distinctive terrain and street pattern.
- 4. The Northwood Hills Historic District is identified with the Land Boom Period (1920- 1928), the Great Depression Era (1929-1940) the World War II and Post-War Period (1941-1971).
- 5. The loss of buildings or structures within the Northwood Hills Historic District would be irreparable to the City

Mr. Kenneth Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

2. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-02</u>: Temple Beth Israel now known as the Yeckes Family Chapel, 2814 Poinsettia Avenue, Designation. This application is for the designation of Temple Beth Israel now known as the Yeckes Family Chapel on West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places. The Temple was previously designated at its previous location at 2020 Broward Avenue. (HPB Case No. 04-167) The City of West Palm is required to maintain and update the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places per Comprehensive Plan – Historic Preservation

Element Policies 1.1.5, 2.1.1, and 2.1.5.

**Policy 1.1.5:** The City will continue to evaluate its historic resources, both archaeological and within the built environment, for eligibility for nomination to the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places and the National Register of Historic Places.

**Policy 2.1.1:** The City will continue to maintain a local register of historic buildings, structures and sites.

**Policy 2.1.5:** The Historic Preservation Division Staff of the City will promote the designation process for properties eligible for listing on the Local or National Register and will continue to provide technical assistance to constituents who express interestin designation.

Steve Yeckes gave a presentation.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-02</u>.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the Historic Structure designation for Temple Beth Israel, at 2814 Poinsettia Avenue, which meets designation Criterion A and B in the areas of Community Development and Social History.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

#### EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Gabriel Jaroslavsky **made a motion to APPROVE** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-02</u>. This case came to be heard on January 26, 2021 at a public hearing before the City of West Palm Beach Historic Preservation Board on the application of the City's Historic Preservation Planner, for the designation of Temple Beth Israel, located at 2814 Poinsettia Avenue, as a Historic Structure under Ordinance No. 4927-21. The Board, upon reviewing the report and recommendation of the Historic Preservation Planner and hearing testimony from the public on such application, makes the following Findings of Fact:

- 1. The subject building is a historically significant structure which is of high importance. It was constructed in 1922-24 or over 99 years ago.
- 2 The subject building is associated with the development of West Palm Beach as a diverse community with a variety of religious, educational, and governmental resources.
- 3. The subject building is the oldest Jewish synagogue in Palm Beach County.

- 4. The subject building is associated with the Land Boom Period in West Palm Beach (1920-1928).
- 5. The subject building is associated with prominent members of the business and civic community of West Palm Beach, including Max Sirkin, Joseph Mendel, and Julius Lax.
- 6. The subject building was built by the local construction firm of Newlon and Stephens.
- 7. The loss of the subject building to the City would be significant.

# Mr. Reginald Stambaugh seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

Mr. Reginald Stambaugh added to the record that the Greene family [of Greene's Pharmacy] attended the original temple. He indicated that Robert Greene was a renowned local Orthopedic Surgeon (now retired); his son also a surgeon. Mr. Stambaugh stated the Greene family was prominent in the Palm Beach County community for paragraph 5.

- 3. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-03</u>: This application is for the designation of William Ohlhaber House on West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places. The House was formerly located at 205 Pilgrim Road and a contributing property within the Belair Historic District and moved one parcel to the west outside of the Historic District. (HPB Case No. 13-46) The City of West Palm is required to maintain and update the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places per Comprehensive Plan Historic Preservation Element Policies 1.1.5, 2.1.1, and 2.1.5.
  - **Policy 1.1.5:** The City will continue to evaluate its historic resources, both archaeological and within the built environment, for eligibility for nomination to the West Palm Beach Register of Historic Places and the National Register of Historic Places.
  - **Policy 2.1.1:** The City will continue to maintain a local register of historic buildings, structures and sites.
  - **Policy 2.1.5:** The Historic Preservation Division Staff of the City will promote the designation process for properties eligible for listing on the Local or National Register and will continue to provide technical assistance to constituents who express interest in designation.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-03</u>.

City Staff recommended **APPROVAL** of the Historic Structure designation of the William Ohlahaber House, 215 Pilgrim Road, which meets designation Criterion A, B, C, and D in the areas of Architecture and Community Development.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Vice-Chairperson Kristin Kellogg made a motion to APPROVE <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-03</u>. This case came to be heard on January 26, 2021 at a public hearing before the City of West Palm Beach Historic Preservation Board on the application of the City's Historic Preservation Planner, for the designation of William Ohlahaber House, located at 215 Pilgrim Road, as a Historic Property under Ordinance No. 4928-21. The Board, upon reviewing the report and recommendation of the Historic Preservation Planner and hearing testimony from the public on such application, makes the following Findings of Fact:

- 1. The subject property is a historically significant property which is of high importance. The primary structure was constructed in 1924 or over 97 years ago. The accessory structure was constructed circa 1925 or 96 years ago.
- 2 The subject building is associated with the Land Boom Period in West Palm Beach (1920-1928).
- 3. The subject property is associated with William Ohlhaber, an architect from Chicago and developed the Belair tract.
- 4. The subject property is designed by architect William Ohlhaber.
- 5. The loss of the subject buildings to the City would be significant.

### Mr. Kenneth Breslauer seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

4. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-04</u>: 911 8<sup>th</sup> Street. This vacant midblock lot was recently acquired by a redevelopment company that proposes to construct a new one-story single-family home on the site. This parcel is in the Northwest neighborhood.

The applicant is requesting approval for the following:

1. Construct a one-story single-family house of approximately 1,686 square feet. The U- shaped plan presents a front elevation of a gable roof flanked by small hip roofs surfaced in asphalt shingles. The exterior surface is smooth stucco with some stone accents. Windows are proposed to be aluminum 6/6 single hungs.

The applicant deferred to Staff's presentation.

Ms. Friederike Mittner presented <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-04</u>.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL of the application with conditions:

- 1. The proposed stone shall be painted white or be a rough brick or stone in a natural light color.
- 2. The driveway shall be reduced to the maximum 20' total width per code and confirmation that 1,000 square feet of landscaping is present in the front yard.

See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Dan Pichney made a **motion to approve** <u>Historic Preservation Case No. 21-04</u>, for new construction, in accordance with the Security of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10, as well as the additional compatibility criteria as set forth in the Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 94-49 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations. The motion is based upon the testimony presented, along with the application submitted and the Staff Report which constitute competent substantial evidence. In addition, the approval of this request is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to ensure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for rehabilitation. The conditions include the following:

- 1. The proposed stone shall be painted white or be a rough brick or stone in a natural light color.
- 2. The driveway shall be reduced to the maximum 20' total width per code and confirmation that 1,000 square feet of landscaping is present in the front yard.

Mr. Nick Kassatly seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

- 5. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-05</u>: 323 Westminster Place withdrawn by the applicant.
- 6. <u>Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-06</u>: 811 7<sup>th</sup> Street. The subject property is 0.07 acres located within 800 block of 7th Street fronting 7th Street. The property is zoned Historic multifamily low, medium and high density, context 1 (NWD-R-C1) Northwest neighborhood district subdistrict and is located within the Northwest

Historic District on a vacant lot. The applicant is proposing to construct a single-family house with a contemporary shotgun style of approximately 1,351.6 square feet. The proposed structure has a front (south) setback of 15 feet and a rear (north) setback of 23.66 feet, meeting the minimum requirements of a 15-foot front setback and a 15-foot rear setback respectively. The structure meets the maximum lot coverage requirement with an all one-story structure and a special exception review bonus.

LeVay Smith, the applicant, gave a presentation.

Mr. Aaron Borngraber presented Historic Preservation Board Case No. 21-06.

City Staff recommended APPROVAL – based on the finding that the petition meets ten (10) of the ten (10) Variance Standards found in Section 94-38(d)(6) of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations (ZLDRs).

Contingent on approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness and any conditions associated with such an approval. The conditions include the following:

- 1. The project shall comply with all Downtown Master Plan (DMP) Requirements.
- 2. The south elevation front porch shall have a reduced massing with wood columns and header.
- 3. The south elevation front porch shall have aluminum or wood railings instead of vinyl railings.
- 4. The siding shall be hardieboard smooth or similar with a bevel or channel bevel profile.
- 5. The windows shall have the appearance of a sash window with a 3/1 lite pattern with a 4-inch wide mullion for all paired windows.
- 6. The materials for construction shall be sourced locally (within 500 miles) first before extending the range.
- 7. The applicant shall use two of the following green measures on the property: rain barrels/cistern, solar panels (rear third only), and/or all hardscape shall be permeable (ex. Turfblock).

# See the Staff Report for detailed history, background and analysis information pertaining to this case.

There was additional discussion between the Board and Staff to include:

- 2017 Florida Building Code was referenced in the Staff report; inquiry made if the new Code had already been adopted in West Palm Beach, January 1, 2021.
- Window Schedule did not address the type of material but designated aluminum. Staff indicated aluminum and vinyl windows are acceptable materials for new construction sites.

• Staff would ensure the project complies with any applicable code changes.

Chairperson Amanda Skier opened the floor to public comment.

No additional members of the public provided comments.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Reginald Stambaugh made a motion to APPROVE Historic Preservation Case No. 21-06, a request by LeVay Smith on behalf of YaVel Construction, for a variance from Section – 94-84(2)(d) and Section – 94-84(2)(e)(1) of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations, which requires a primary structure to have meet a side (each) and cumulative side setback requirement of 5'-0" (each) and 15'-0" respectively in the Historic multifamily low, medium and high density, context 1 (NWD-R-C1) Northwest neighborhood district subdistrict at 811 7th Street. The applicant is requesting a 4'-0" side (west side), 4'-0" side (east side), and a 8'-0" cumulative (west and east side) side setback allow for a construction of a single family house, thus granting a 1'-0" side (west side), 1'-0" side (east side), and a 8'-0" cumulative (west and east side) side setback variance. The motion is based upon the testimony presented along with the application submitted and the staff report, which constitute competent, substantial evidence. The Historic Preservation Board hereby makes findings of fact that each of the ten criteria in Article II, Section 94-38(d)(6) have been met for the variance. In addition, the granting of this Variance is made conditional upon the following restrictions, stipulations and/or safeguards that I move are necessary to insure compliance with the purpose and intent of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations and consistent with the Comprehensive Plan of the City of West Palm Beach:

Contingent on approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness and any conditions associated with such an approval. The conditions include the following:

- 1. The project shall comply with all Downtown Master Plan (DMP) Requirements.
- 2. The south elevation front porch shall have a reduced massing with wood columns and header.
- 3. The south elevation front porch shall have aluminum or wood railings instead of vinyl railings.
- 4. The siding shall be hardieboard smooth or similar with a bevel or channel bevel profile.
- 5. The windows shall have the appearance of a sash window with a 3/1 lite pattern with a 4-inch wide mullion for all paired windows.
- 6. The materials for construction shall be sourced locally (within 500 miles) first before extending the range.
- 7. The applicant shall use two of the following green measures on the property: rain barrels/cistern, solar panels (rear third only), and/or all hardscape shall be permeable (ex. Turfblock).

Mr. Dan Pichney seconded the motion; the motion passed 7-0.

# A. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

# **B. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Amanda Skier adjourned the meeting at approximately 6:01 P.M.

Please be advised that these minutes are not verbatim. An audio copy of the meeting may be requested through the City of West Palm Beach City Clerk's office at 822-1210. There is a fee.

\* \* \* \* \*

This signature is to attest	t that the undersigned is the Chairperson, or designee, of the Historia
Preservation Board Me	eting and that the information provided herein is the true and correct
Minutes for the January	26, 2021, meeting of the Historic Preservation Board Meeting, dated
this day of	March , 2021.

Chairperson (or designee)